

The Anglo-Catholic Tradition in Australian Anglicanism

Dr David Hilliard

Reader in History, Flinders University
Adelaide, Australia

Anglicanism in Australia has had many Anglo-Catholics but no single version of Anglo-Catholicism.¹ Anglo-Catholics have comprised neither a church nor a sect, nor have they been a tightly organised party. Within a framework of common ideas about the apostolic succession, the sacraments and the central role of 'the Church' in mediating salvation, they were, and remain, diverse in outlook, with few organs or institutions to link them together and to promote common goals. Since the mid-nineteenth century, in Australia as in England, two very different trends in the movement can be identified. There were Anglo-Catholics who were primarily concerned with personal religion and the relationship of the individual soul to God, and those, influenced by Incarnational theology, who were concerned to draw out the implications of the Catholic

¹ Published works on Anglo-Catholicism in Australia include: Brian Porter (ed.), *Colonial Tractarians: The Oxford Movement in Australia* (Melbourne, 1989); Austin Cooper, 'Newman—The Oxford Movement—Australia', in B.J. Lawrence Cross (ed.), *Shadows and Images: The Papers of the Newman Centenary Symposium, Sydney, August 1979* (Melbourne, 1981), pp. 99-113; Colin Holden, 'Awful Happenings on the Hill': *E.S. Hughes and Melbourne Anglo-Catholicism before the War* (Melbourne, 1992) and *From Tories at Prayer to Socialists at Mass: St Peter's, Eastern Hill, Melbourne, 1846-1990* (Melbourne, 1996); Colin Holden (ed.), *Anglo-Catholicism in Melbourne: Papers to Mark the 150th Anniversary of St Peter's, Eastern Hill, 1846-1996* (Melbourne, 1997); L.C. Rodd, *John Hope of Christ Church St Laurence: A Sydney Church Era* (Sydney 1972); Ruth Teale, 'The "Red Book" Case', *Journal of Religious History*, vol. 12, no. 1 (1982), pp. 74-89; David Hilliard, 'The Transformation of South Australian Anglicanism, c. 1880-1930', *Journal of Religious History*, vol. 14, no. 1 (1986), pp. 38-56; Keith Rayner, 'A Reflection on what Newman Means to the Anglican Church in Australia', *St Mark's Review*, no. 151 (Spring 1992), pp. 3-9; John A. Moses, 'Canon David John Garland and the ANZAC Tradition', *St Mark's Review*, no. 154 (Winter 1993), pp. 12-21. Theses: Austin Cooper, 'The Oxford Movement and Australia' (PhD thesis, Monash University, 1973); Janet Scarfe, "'Bridge of Polished Steel as Fine as a Hair": The Oxford Movement in South Australia, 1836-1881' (MA thesis, University of Adelaide, 1974); Ruth M. Frappell, 'The Anglican Ministry to the Unsettled Rural Districts of Australia, c. 1890 to 1940' (PhD thesis, University of Sydney, 1992). For sociological studies, see Francis Penhale, *The Anglican Church Today: Catholics in Crisis* (Oxford, 1986), and W.S.F. Pickering, *Anglo-Catholicism: A Study in Religious Ambiguity* (London, 1989).

This article is a revised version of a paper given at the 'Studying Australian Christianity' conference held at Robert Menzies College, Macquarie University, Sydney, July 1993.

Published in *St. Mark's Review*, number 158, Winter, 1994

Reproduced with permission; Project Canterbury AD 2003

religion for the world in which the Son of God had lived as a human being.² The term 'Anglo-Catholic' itself is a fluid one, for its meaning changed over time and place. Many of the teachings and practices which were attacked in the 1840s as 'Puseyite' were by the end of the nineteenth century widely regarded as normal expressions of Anglicanism. The great majority of clergy and lay people whose outlook had been shaped by Tractarian theology did not define themselves as Anglo-Catholics and never joined specifically 'party' organisations. Even among those who called themselves Anglo-Catholics there have always been problems of identifying who is and who is not. Among clergy there was always a division. On the one hand, there were those who saw themselves as teaching 'the Catholic faith in its fulness', though they were often seen by others as extremists or 'Romanisers', and who tried in effect to create a church within a church, with its own distinctive customs and vocabulary. On the other hand, there were those who represented a more diffusive and moderate Anglo-Catholicism, in which 'Anglican' was as important as 'Catholic'. This 'Prayer Book Catholicism' in the long run affected in some degree the majority of Anglican parishes in Australia.

In more confident days, Anglo-Catholics liked to portray their history in Australia since the 1840s as one of linear progress, overcoming Protestant fanatics and cautious bishops in their goal of recovering the true Catholic heritage of the Church of England. Their apologetic was based on historical arguments. The fundamental premise was that the Church of England was not, as was popularly believed, a creation of Henry VIII, but was the ancient 'Catholic Church of the English people'—the church of St Alban, St Augustine of Canterbury and St Bede. At the Reformation it had thrown off the yoke of the Papacy and was purified of Romish superstitions, while retaining intact the Catholic essentials of the threefold ministry of bishop, priest and deacon, and valid sacraments.³ In this reading of history, the Church of England was one of the three branches of the Catholic Church, alongside the Roman and Orthodox churches. The Evangelical Revival in the Church of England received two stars for its missionary zeal and its philanthropic and social concerns, but it was incomplete. Its true fulfilment was the Oxford Movement which convinced the Church of England of its 'Catholic heritage' and 'restored the full and proper use of the Prayer Book'.⁴ Therefore Anglo-Catholics were not a mere

² Gabriel Hebert SSM, 'Strands in Anglo-Catholicism', *Australian Church Quarterly*, October 1956, pp. 25-32.

³ E.g., T.B. McCall, *Is the Church of England Changing?* (2nd ed., Sydney, 1959), pp. 11-20.

⁴ Bishop John Frewer, in *West Australian Church News* (Perth), July 1933, p. 14.

party or faction within the Church, but the fullest and truest expression of Anglicanism. ‘They must not think of themselves as one set of permitted views within the Church’, Bishop Hart of Wangaratta told a meeting in the Melbourne Town Hall in 1933, commemorating the centenary of the Oxford Movement: ‘it was their business to make every member of the Church aware of his Catholic heritage and readily to accept Catholic practices’.⁵

In fact the spread and permeation of Anglo-Catholic influence in Australia was uneven. Anglo-Catholicism took deep root in sparsely settled rural and outback dioceses and became a tolerated minority in the major urban dioceses, while in Sydney, the largest diocese in the country, it gained hardly a foothold. Some, half jokingly, detected a correlation with climate. When an English member of the Society of St Francis visited Australia in 1957 he was told on arrival that he would find ‘Churchmanship rising with the average temperature of the dioceses as they approached the Equator’.⁶

Why was this, and what were the distinctive features of Australian Anglo-Catholicism? In Australia the Church of England had Evangelical foundations, whereas Anglo-Catholicism, which was essentially a Victorian creation, was a late arrival. It flourished best where Evangelicalism was weak. Almost all those in England who took an interest in the colonial church in the 1830s and 1840s were Tractarians. They saw the colonies as a field in which the English church might be built on sound Catholic principles, under bishops independent of the state who had an inherent spiritual authority based on an unbroken succession from the apostles. The *Tracts*, wrote Newman to Pusey in 1840, ‘shall go to Van Diemen’s Land, and welcome; if they have not already gone’.⁷ Tractarians were responsible for the founding of the Colonial Bishops Fund in 1841 and the *Colonial Church Chronicle* in 1847.⁸ The first Bishop of Australia, W.G. Broughton, began as a conservative High Churchman, committed to maintaining a privileged position for the Church of England in equal partnership with the State, but in a religiously mixed society he found the principles expounded in the *Tracts* to be useful because they provided a

⁵ *Church of England Messenger* (Melbourne), August 1933, p. 344.

⁶ Charles Preston SSF, in *Church Times* (London), 3 May 1957, p. 11.

⁷ Newman to Pusey, 15 July 1840, quoted in Cooper, ‘The Oxford Movement and Australia’, p. 188.

⁸ Ruth Teale, ‘Dr Pusey and the Church Overseas’, in Perry Butler (ed), *Pusey Rediscovered* (London, 1983), pp.185-209.

coherent and sophisticated justification for the existence of ‘the Church’, and he thought that Tractarian clergy were the right type for the colonies.⁹

Under Bishop Broughton the Church of England in New South Wales had its own Oxford Movement which challenged the theology and self-understanding of the church that had been planted by Richard Johnson and Samuel Marsden. By the mid-1840s three prominent churches in the city of Sydney were ministered to by clergymen whose teachings on the church, its ministry, sacraments and worship were definitely Tractarian (or ‘Puseyite’).¹⁰ In the isolated Australian colonies in the 1840s no one knew much about Puseyism except that it was next-door to Popery, which evoked remarks such as ‘I will never go to Church if he [the clergyman] is a Puseyite’, recorded at Port Phillip in 1843.¹¹

Then in 1848, three years after the secession of John Henry Newman, two of Bishop Broughton’s imported clergy, R. K. Sconce and T.C. Makinson, defected to Rome. Their ‘perversion’ to an apostate, politically devious, lower class and Irish church was seen as ‘a social and national betrayal’.¹² In a published defence of his decision Sconce praised Broughton, whose sympathy for the ideas of the Oxford Movement had been ‘very useful in leading people to the conclusion that the primitive Church was identical in its character with that which is now in communion with the Holy See’.¹³ The Protestant temper of Sydney’s Anglican lay people was reinforced and Broughton’s position was weakened.

But as clerical converts to Rome, Sconce and Makinson had very few followers. In Australia the great majority of Anglo-Catholic clergy (and lay people) were not attracted by the ethos and outlook of Irish-dominated Roman Catholicism and preferred to remain where they were. Until the minor wave of secessions that began in the 1980s, triggered by the debate over the ordination of women to the priesthood, the Australian clergymen who defected to Rome

⁹ Austin Cooper, ‘Bishop Broughton and the Diocese of Australia’, in Porter (ed.), *Colonial Tractarians*, pp. 23-34; G. P. Shaw, *Patriarch and Patriot: William Grant Broughton, 1788-1853: Colonial Statesman and Ecclesiastic* (Melbourne, 1978).

¹⁰ R.K. Sconce at St Andrew’s; Robert Allwood at St James; W.H. Walsh at Christ Church St Laurence.

¹¹ James Grant, ‘The Diocese of Melbourne (and Victoria)’, in Porter (ed.), *Colonial Tractarians*, p. 64.

¹² Kenneth J. Cable, ‘The Dioceses of Sydney and Newcastle’, in Porter (ed), *Colonial Tractarians*, p. 39.

¹³ R.K. Sconce, *A Second Letter to the Lord Bishop of Sydney...*(Sydney, 1848), p. 15.

were usually junior in rank and on the margins of Anglican church life.¹⁴ And in the church of their adoption, few of them achieved prominence: there was no Australian equivalent of Newman, Manning or Ronald Knox. Anglo-Catholics had a love-hate relationship with the Church of Rome. Some leading figures, such as Canon Farnham Maynard of St Peter's, Eastern Hill, in Melbourne, were as hostile as any Evangelical, though for very different reasons. They were deeply affronted by Rome's denial of validity to their sacramental ministrations and regarded Papalism as alien to true Catholicism, 'a fruitful cause of evil in the Church'.¹⁵ In this view the Roman Church was merely an alien and intruding 'Italian Mission' to the English people, who already had their own national and ancient Catholic Church.

The Oxford Tractarians were primarily concerned with doctrinal questions, but their teachings, when conjoined to those of the Cambridge ecclesiologists, led logically to ritualism as an outward expression of Catholic doctrines. The object was to arouse the instinct of worship in a 'religious' atmosphere, to convey to individuals through particular forms of ritual, in a 'correct' gothic setting, an authentic experience of the transcendent.¹⁶ The spread of the influence of the Oxford Movement in Australia during the second half of the nineteenth century can therefore be charted by changes in the patterns of worship and by the introduction into churches of symbolic ecclesiastical ornaments and forms of ceremonial. As elsewhere in the Anglican world, this amounted to a liturgical revolution.¹⁷

The first Anglican churches to be built in Australia were unadorned auditoriums designed for preaching and the reading of services from the Book of Common Prayer. Edmund Blacket's Christ Church St Laurence in Sydney, consecrated in 1845, was notable as the first complete Gothic revival church in Australia, with the sanctuary as a focal point, the altar being raised several steps above the nave. The incumbent, W. H. Walsh, a moderate Tractarian, introduced the practice of preaching in a surplice instead of a black gown and of vesting in cassock and surplice the male choristers, who entered and left the church in procession.

¹⁴ E.g., C.A. Britten, *From Shadow to Substance: An Australian Anglican Clergyman becomes a Catholic* (Melbourne, 1957). The author was a former curate of All Saints', Wickham Terrace, Brisbane.

¹⁵ Farnham E. Maynard, *The Continuity of the Church of England: A Story of the Kings and Popes of the Sixteenth Century* (Melbourne, 1939).

¹⁶ Penhale, *The Anglican Church Today*, ch. 4.

¹⁷ Nigel Yates, *Buildings, Faith, and Worship: The Liturgical Arrangements of Anglican Churches, 1600-1900* (Oxford, 1991), ch. 7.

A second wave of ceremonial innovations reached the Australian colonies in the late 1860s, though until the 1880s its impact was slight. The new ways of worship were introduced by a small number of parish clergymen in the capital cities who claimed to be reviving what the Prayer Book ordered, or at least did not forbid.¹⁸ Their churches set standards which others followed when opportunity offered. The main innovations were these: the communion table became an altar, sometimes of stone or marble, vested with embroidered frontals in ‘correct’ liturgical colours; the altar surmounted by a brass cross, vases for flowers and perhaps two lighted candles to symbolise ‘Christ the light of the world’; a weekly ‘early celebration’, at 7.30 or 8am, which made it easier to communicate while devoutly fasting—a practice that the Tractarians invested with great significance; a choral celebration of Holy Communion at 11am on at least one or two Sundays each month, instead of Morning Prayer; the celebrant, wearing a coloured stole, taking the ‘eastward’ position (standing in front of the altar) instead of the traditional ‘north-end’; bowing to the altar and making the sign of the cross; the observance with extra services of the season of Lent and major feasts and holy days; the decoration of the church for the greater festivals. Along with this went the adoption of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* (first used in Melbourne in 1863), which to Protestant-minded Anglicans was a ‘dangerous book’ because it was a Tractarian compilation and included adaptations of hymns from Latin and Greek sources. During the next fifty or sixty years in an ever-growing number of parishes most of these practices became widely accepted, having lost whatever doctrinal significance they once had, and *Hymns Ancient and Modern* became the most widely used Anglican hymnbook. The style of Anglican worship in 1900 was very different from 1840. Innovations of one generation became traditions in the next.

The movement towards a greater decorum in the conduct of church services was of course not unique to Anglicans. It was part of a much wider religious development of the late nineteenth century in Australia, Britain and North America, where Presbyterians, Wesleyan Methodists and Congregationalists were likewise decorating their church interiors and embellishing their worship to create a more ‘religious’ atmosphere, wholly different from the world outside. The trend appealed most of all to prosperous urban dwellers, people of culture and taste, who liked things done ‘properly’ and who could afford to beautify their churches with stained glass windows and

¹⁸ In Adelaide the pioneers were Archdeacon Dove of St Andrew’s, Walkerville, and Dean Russell of St Paul’s, Pulteney Street; Brisbane—Canon Robinson, All Saints’, Wickham Terrace; Melbourne—Canon Gregory, All Saints’, St Kilda; Hobart—Dean Dundas, St David’s Cathedral; Sydney—C.F. Garnsey, Christ Church St Laurence; Perth—Dean Goldsmith, St George’s Cathedral.

imported furnishings, often as family memorials. It is significant that in Sydney, and to a lesser degree in Melbourne and Adelaide, the religious party line corresponded to a social division.¹⁹ Evangelical or Low Church strongholds tended to be the oldest churches near the centre of the city, whereas most of those churches which had a reputation for being ‘high’ were located in the new and comfortable residential suburbs: for example, St Mark’s, Darling Point, St Mary’s, Waverley, and All Saints’, Hunters Hill, in Sydney; Christ Church, South Yarra and All Saints’, St Kilda, in Melbourne; St Andrew’s, Walkerville, and St Peter’s, Glenelg, in Adelaide.

There is some evidence that these churches attracted a disproportionate number of women. In the 1890s, from the evidence of service registers, it appears that women outnumbered men among communicants at weekday or early celebrations of Holy Communion by as much as six to one. It was a touchy issue. Evangelicals were condescending, often hinting that the ‘sensitive’ style of Anglo-Catholicism was inferior to their own ‘robust, rugged piety’.²⁰ The reason appears to be that ‘high’ churches offered to women satisfactions that were not available to the same extent elsewhere in the Church of England. They could use their domestic skills in making, embroidering, arranging and caring for devotional and liturgical objects. There were daily services in church—a sacred place outside the home. In private confession, advocated by Anglo-Catholic clergy in Australia from the 1890s, they had the opportunity of discussing personal matters with a man who was not their father or husband.

The most visible—and controversial—indicator of ‘definite Catholic teaching’ was the use of eucharistic vestments. These had first appeared in Australia in the mid-1880s²¹ but twenty years later they were regularly used in no more than a dozen or twenty parishes, mostly in New South Wales and South Australia. This was a much smaller proportion of the total than in England, but higher than in New Zealand or Canada. From the 1920s the use of vestments became more widespread. However, in some rural dioceses, such as Gippsland, Bendigo and Bathurst, they were almost unknown until after the Second World War.²²

Hand-in-hand with the introduction of symbol and ceremonial was the *teaching* of the doctrines and practices of the English branch of the Catholic

¹⁹ Ruth Teale, ‘Party or Principle? The Election to the Anglican See of Sydney in 1889-90’, *Journal of the Royal Australian Historical Society*, vol. 55, part 2 (1969), pp. 147-8.

²¹ Christ Church St Laurence, Sydney, 1884; St Martin’s, Hawksburn (Melbourne), 1887; Christ Church, Kapunda (South Australia), 1889.

²² Frappell, ‘The Anglican Ministry to the Unsettled Rural Districts of Australia’, pp. 390-91.

Church. In the Anglo-Catholic vocabulary the word ‘teaching’ occupied a similar place to ‘conversion’ among Evangelicals. In parishes the pastoral strategy of Anglo-Catholic clergy was aimed at inculcating among Church of England lay people a sense of ‘the Church’ as a divinely-founded society and instructing them in the ‘duties’ of church membership, so as to make every parishioner a ‘thorough Churchman’. The importance of confirmation was emphasised, as the gateway to Holy Communion, and from the 1890s a spate of devotional manuals and little books of ‘sound Church teaching’ were published for confirmation candidates. Another method of teaching was the parish mission, which became popular among from the mid-1880s. The pattern of the mission was similar to those that were being conducted in Roman Catholic parishes by religious orders which specialised in the work.²³ The object was to reinvigorate ‘the faithful’ and to restore ‘the lapsed’ through a series of addresses which outlined the way to heaven through the sacramental system of the church. The other side of this new sense of being proudly Church of England was a cooling of relations between Anglicans and non-episcopal Protestants, who in the eyes of Anglo-Catholic clergy were outside the Catholic Church.

Changes in the conduct of worship caused controversy. From the 1860s onwards, debates over ritualism became a regular part of Anglican life, the subject of polemical pamphlets, synod resolutions and countless columns of letters to the newspapers. The last major eruption was in Brisbane in 1956.²⁴ Angry Evangelicals had no doubt that ‘ritualism’ was an ‘organised conspiracy’, which sought to ‘lead them in a covert and insidious manner, away from Protestantism into the Church of Rome’.²⁵ Anglican lay people everywhere were sensitive about the issue. Many of them were attached to the forms of worship they had known all their lives and did not like High Church practices in worship when foisted on them in the church they had paid for, without the agreement of wardens or vestry. Moreover, they disapproved of the new religious vocabulary—words and phrases such as ‘eucharist’, ‘Catholic priest’, confession, ‘Blessed Sacrament’ and ‘the Church teaches’—which seemed to be indistinguishable from the language of Roman Catholicism. At the time feelings ran high; some parishioners voted with their feet.

²³ Hugh Jackson, *Churches and People in Australia and New Zealand, 1860-1930* (Wellington and Sydney, 1987), ch. 3.

²⁴ *Courier-Mail*, 22 March 1956; *Australian Church Record*, 26 April 1956, pp. 3, 6; K. Rayner, ‘The History of the Church of England in Queensland’ (PhD thesis, University of Queensland, 1962), pp. 597-8.

²⁵ *SA Register*, 8 May 1869.

In 1906 a Melbourne Protestant paper reported that a visitor to St Peter's, Eastern Hill, had emerged from the Sunday morning service advertised as 'High Mass' and was accosted by an elderly man with tears in his voice: 'I have belonged to the Church of England all my life, sir. I never was here before, but if this is what the Church of England is coming to, I can't stand it; I shall leave the Church.' 'You must not do anything of the kind', he was told. 'This (St Peter's) is not the Church of England service; it is a piece of bastard Popery.'²⁶ About the same time the *Argus* newspaper published an anti-ritualist poem which included lines such as:

If you want a feast of horrors you can get your very fill
If you come along on Sunday to St Peter's on the hill.²⁷

At the local level much depended on the personality of the clergyman and the way the changes were handled. In Adelaide in the 1890s a critic of ritualism conceded that he had heard people say: 'Mr So-and-so is such an excellent preacher, that we put up with his peculiarities as to ritual; besides, we are not bound to agree with everything he says or does.'²⁸ Perhaps it is the absence of major splits and secessions that needs explanation. Anglicans had long been accustomed to different parties and schools of thought; so in turn they adjusted to accommodate Anglo-Catholic ceremonial and forms of worship.

In the spread of Anglo-Catholicism in Australia the primary impetus came from England, which was the source of theological, apologetic and devotional works, church periodicals, liturgical fashions and, in 1892, the first religious order of women, the Community of the Sisters of the Church. Most important was the influence of English bishops elected to Australian sees from the 1880s onwards and of clergy who were recruited around the turn of the century for the Australian colonies. Having come from a church which by this time had been deeply influenced by the Oxford Movement, they tended to be 'high' rather than 'low'. Young clergy with definite Anglo-Catholic views were often attracted by the romantic prospect of planting the full Catholic faith in the colonies, without the restrictions they encountered at home—just as Australian Anglo-Catholics later sought to do the same in New Guinea. Some of them came to Australia to join the bush brotherhoods, which were founded in the

²⁶ *Victorian Churchman* (Melbourne), 23 February 1906, p. 47.

²⁷ Reprinted in *Defender* (Adelaide), no. 26 (April 1925), p. 15.

²⁸ E.K. Miller, *Reminiscences of Forty-Seven Years' Clerical Life in South Australia* (Adelaide, 1895), p. 267.

years after 1897 to minister to the sparsely settled rural areas.²⁹ So it is no coincidence that those dioceses which eventually became predominantly Anglo-Catholic in the twentieth century were those rural and outback dioceses such as Riverina, Rockhampton, North Queensland, Willochra, Koorlie and Bunbury which had a high proportion of English-born and English-trained clergy. Because the bishops of these dioceses could not obtain Australian-born clergy from the well established Low Church dioceses of Sydney and Melbourne, they were forced to depend on England. Small dioceses in particular tended to become 'monochrome' rather than pluralist, with almost all the clergy of the same school of thought. These factors largely explain the rise in churchmanship.³⁰

The movement gained Australian disciples. Some Australian clergy visited England, were impressed by what they saw of Anglo-Catholicism in its most flourishing parishes and returned to Australia inspired to do the same. The first indigenous religious orders of women, the Society of the Sacred Advent in Brisbane and the Community of the Holy Name in Melbourne, emerged in the 1890s, and the first locally-founded men's community, the Community of the Ascension, began at Goulburn in 1921.³¹ Anglo-Catholic organisations were started. These included the Australian Church Union (1919), with its quarterly paper *The Defender*,³² and Australian branches of English Anglo-Catholic societies such as the Confraternity of the Blessed Sacrament (1889), the Guild of Servants of the Sanctuary (1920), the Guild of All Souls, the Guild of St Barnabas for Nurses, and the Society of Mary. There was also the influence of diocesan theological colleges, headed by imported English clergymen, which were founded in the thirty years after 1880. These colleges shaped the outlook of the next generation of Australian-born clergy. Most of them—for example, St Barnabas' College in Adelaide, St Aidan's College in Ballarat and St Francis' College in Brisbane—combined a Catholic interpretation of the Book of Common Prayer with an acceptance of 'moderate' biblical criticism. This was

²⁹ Rayner, 'The History of the Anglican Church in Queensland', pp. 312-18; R.M. Frappell, 'The Australian Bush Brotherhoods and their English Origins', *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, vol. 47, no. 1 (1996), pp. 82-97; R.A.F. Webb, *Brothers in the Sun: A History of the Bush Brotherhood Movement in the Outback of Australia* (Adelaide, 1978).

³⁰ The subject is discussed in Frappell, 'The Anglican Ministry to the Unsettled Rural Districts of Australia', chs 2 and 5.

³¹ E.C. Rowland, 'The History of the Religious Life in Australia', *Australian Church Quarterly*, September 1970, pp. 15-28; Lynne Strahan, *Out of the Silence: A Study of a Religious Community for Women: The Community of the Holy Name* (Melbourne, 1988).

³² *The Defender: The Organ of the Australian Church Union*, 1919-35, succeeded by *The Australian Church Quarterly*, 1936-73.

the liberal Catholicism of Bishop Gore and *Lux Mundi*.³³ Australian theological students read the *Church Times* and found inspiration in the biographies of English Anglo-Catholic slum priests or ‘martyrs for ritualism’.

Despite the movement’s continuing links with England, an indigenous leadership soon emerged: for example, E.S. Hughes, J.S. Hart, John Hope, C.J. Whitfield. These clergy and bishops were ecclesiastical nationalists, believing that the ‘self-government of every part of the Church is the expression of her Catholicity’.³⁴ They strongly supported the idea of an autonomous Australian Anglican church, without the legal nexus which tied the church in Australia to the Church of England at home. This view was shared by many bishops who were not Anglo-Catholics, but Evangelicals, especially in Sydney, were suspicious, fearing that the autonomy movement was being pushed by Anglo-Catholics who wanted to undo the Reformation Settlement and gain liturgical and ritual freedom from English legal restrictions.³⁵ In the drawn-out negotiations that led to the acceptance in 1962 of a constitution for a self-governing Church of England in Australia—at times, Sydney versus the rest—Anglo-Catholics were forced to compromise.

By the last decade of the nineteenth century it was clear that the Australian colonial dioceses were becoming more diverse in their dominant theology and styles of worship, and this trend continued. In South Australia, where Methodism and the English ‘Nonconformist’ tradition were particularly strong, Anglo-Catholic sacramentalism reinforced an existing sense of Anglican distinctiveness. In 1891 a clerical visitor gained the impression that Adelaide was ‘one of the most Catholic dioceses in Australia’.³⁶ In Melbourne, by contrast, a well-informed journalist observed in 1899, out of the clergy ministering to more than eighty churches, ‘it would not be easy to find a score actively teaching the doctrines and ceremonies of High Anglicanism’, while only St Peter’s, Eastern Hill, could be regarded as ‘distinctly ritualistic’.³⁷

³³ For the impact of St Aidan’s College on the churchmanship of Ballarat, see John Spooner, *The Golden See: Diocese of Ballarat: The Anglican Church in Western Victoria* (Sydney, 1989), pp. 142-7.

³⁴ Canon [J.S.] Hart, ‘Autonomy. In the Light of Church History’, in *Australian Church Congress, Brisbane, 1913. Official Report* (Brisbane, 1913), p. 121.

³⁵ Holden, ‘Awful Happenings on the Hill’, pp.108-12. The story is told and the issues discussed in John Davis, *Australian Anglicans and their Constitution* (Canberra, 1993).

³⁶ ‘The Church in the Colonies’, *Banner and Anglo-Catholic Review* (Sydney), February 1892. See also Janet Scarfe, ‘The Diocese of Adelaide (and the West)’, in Porter (ed), *Colonial Tractarians*, pp. 75-101.

³⁷ *Age*, 7 June 1899.

Anglo-Catholic influence spread to the country dioceses more slowly. In the dioceses of Riverina and Grafton and Armidale, for example, in the 1890s English clergy introduced the services and ceremonial of a moderate Anglo-Catholicism in some of the larger country towns, such as Narrandera and Moree. In Riverina after the election of Bishop Halse in 1926 a more pronounced Anglo-Catholicism became dominant, which meant six candles on the altar, Sung Mass as the principal service on Sunday mornings and *English Hymnal* supplanting *Hymns Ancient and Modern*. Similarly in North Queensland the first bishops were Evangelical and the lay people were Low Church, but Anglo-Catholicism became well established during the long episcopate of Bishop Feetham, from 1913 to 1947.³⁸ At St John's, Cairns, for example, a weekly service of Holy Communion was not commenced until 1906, but the term 'Mass' was introduced by an Anglo-Catholic rector only seven years later.³⁹ When Feetham went to North Queensland, he recalled, the people 'told me they hoped I was a Protestant', whereas he saw himself as 'the Catholic Bishop of North Queensland'.⁴⁰ By 1925 North Queensland was reported in England to be 'one of the most active of Catholic outposts'.⁴¹ Anglo-Catholicism was reinforced by the isolation of the region and its sense of difference from the rest of Australia, the influence of the Brotherhood of St Barnabas, whose members formed a sizeable bloc of the clergy of the diocese, and the foundation of boarding schools (three of them run by sisters of the Society of the Sacred Advent) which were 'based upon and inspired by the principles of the Catholic religion'.⁴²

By the 1930s a definite pattern had emerged. Rural dioceses were 'higher' than capital city dioceses; the smaller, the poorer and the hotter the diocese, the higher the average churchmanship. The taken-for-granted Anglo-Catholic culture of these dioceses was socially and politically conservative. Its ethos was very different from the rather self-conscious Anglo-Catholic congregationalism of the capital cities, often tinged with radical Socialism, or the experience of being a 'Lone Scout type Catholic' in conservative Tasmania. One of those who attended the occasional meetings of the Tasmanian state branch of the Australian Church Union in the 1940s recalled the conspiratorial

³⁸ Alison Hayhoe, 'John Oliver Feetham: A Study of his Life and Influence in North Queensland, 1913-1947' (BA Honours thesis, University of Queensland, 1968).

³⁹ St John's Church, Cairns, Queensland, Service Registers.

⁴⁰ The Bishop of North Queensland [J.O. Feetham], 'Catholicity', *Australian Church Quarterly*, December 1946, p. 28.

⁴¹ *Church Times*, 3 July 1925, quoted in *Church Record*, 3 September 1925, p. 1.

⁴² 'Twenty Years Bishop of North Queensland', *Church Standard*, 28 April 1933.

atmosphere: ‘they were quite delicious really, because everyone was called Father, and we could say the Hail Mary without anyone getting into trouble’.⁴³

Anglo-Catholics were convinced that they were on the winning side and were inclined to sneer at Evangelicals (and ‘Sydney’ in particular) for their ‘backwardness’:

I have every confidence that in due time the Protestant party in the English Church in Australia will pass away. So far as I can gather, the only stronghold of the Protestants [is] in the Sydney Diocese, but even these must in the course of time give place to a superior class of church-folk.⁴⁴

They did not reckon on the determination of Sydney Evangelicals—avid readers of Anglo-Catholic newspapers to find out what the enemy was doing—to draw the line against what they often referred to as ‘Anglo-Romanism’ and keep creeping ritualism at bay. From 1910 Archbishop Wright refused to license incumbents in his diocese unless they promised not to wear vestments, thereby cutting off Anglo-Catholic ritualism in Sydney before it had a chance to expand.⁴⁵ As the relationship between Sydney and the majority of other dioceses deteriorated (demonstrated by the election of Archbishop Le Fanu of Perth rather than Mowll of Sydney as Primate in 1935), influential Evangelicals in Sydney launched their counter-attack. In 1944 they supported a group of laymen in the mid-west of New South Wales in legal action against Bishop Wylde of Bathurst for authorising a devotional manual and particular ritual practices in his diocese. This was the ‘Red Book case’, which poisoned relations between Sydney and the New South Wales country dioceses for a decade.⁴⁶

In Melbourne, too, Evangelicals rallied to stem the advance of ritualism, but Archbishop Lowther Clarke avoided confrontation. In 1906, following a recent ruling by the English archbishops, he laid down that the ceremonial use of incense, which E.S. Hughes had recently introduced at St Peter’s, Eastern Hill, should be discontinued, though vestments would be

⁴³ Geoffrey Stephens, *The Anglican Church in Tasmania: A Diocesan History to Mark the Sesquicentenary, 1992* (Hobart, 1991), p. 194.

⁴⁴ ‘Sydney to London’, *Banner and Anglo-Catholic Review*, June 1891.

⁴⁵ Stephen Judd and Kenneth Cable, *Sydney Anglicans: A History of the Diocese* (Sydney, 1987), pp. 161-5.

⁴⁶ *The Bathurst Ritual Case* (Sydney, [1948]); Teale, ‘The “Red Book” Case’; Judd and Cable, *Sydney Anglicans*, pp. 253-5; Davis, *Australian Anglicans and their Constitution*, pp. 111-30.

allowed.⁴⁷ Hughes accepted the compromise and the temperature was lowered. Anglo-Catholicism in Melbourne survived as a minority tradition, within a broadly Evangelical and tolerant diocese. ‘There is no overt hostility, no grievous tyranny, no glaring injustice’, declared Canon Maynard of St Peter’s in 1957, but there had been no episcopal encouragement either.⁴⁸

Meanwhile, as new and more exotic forms of Anglo-Catholicism filtered into Australia, bishops came under pressure to suppress ‘extreme opinions’ beyond the tolerant limits of the Church of England. In 1915 Father Bede Frost of Broken Hill in western New South Wales was charged with heresy by Bishop Anderson of Riverina—allegedly the only Anglican heresy trial ever held in Australia—for having taught his confirmation candidates from a book of own composition which advocated confession to a priest before communion, invocation of the Virgin Mary and the Saints, and other Romish practices.⁴⁹ In Adelaide in 1918 Father Wise of St George’s, Goodwood, founded a branch of a very unProtestant body, the Living Rosary of Our Lady and S. Dominic (with rosaries imported from Belgium), held Expositions of the Blessed Sacrament and published the *St George’s Mass Book for Lay Folk*, a collection of services, prayers and devotions of medieval and post-Reformation Roman Catholic origin. Bishop Nutter Thomas in 1919 charged him with the ecclesiastical offence of ‘breach of ritual’, because he had conducted public worship in a manner inconsistent with the Book of Common Prayer.⁵⁰ Two years later, after much legal manoeuvring, the case was dropped, though the charges were not formally withdrawn. For many years St George’s remained beyond the pale. At the same time in Melbourne Father Cyril Barclay of St John’s, Latrobe Street, came under heavy fire for an article he had had written which was alleged to contain ‘incipient Mariolatry’.⁵¹ After St John’s was sold by the diocese, in an attempt to destroy its influence, Barclay’s refugee congregation found a home in Fitzroy where in 1923 it opened St Mary’s Mission Church. This became quite famous in Melbourne as the centre of a flamboyant Anglo-Catholicism. It had Roman ceremonial, a high altar with

⁴⁷ *Victorian Churchman*, 27 April 1906, p. 91; Holden, ‘Awful Happenings on the Hill’, pp. 80-82.

⁴⁸ St Peter’s, Eastern Hill Melbourne, *Parish Paper*, Summer 1957.

⁴⁹ Laurel Clyde, *In a Strange Land: A History of the Anglican Diocese of Riverina* (Melbourne, 1979), pp. 206-9.

⁵⁰ H.J. Harrison and J.M. Truran, *St George’s, Goodwood, 1880-1980* (Goodwood, 1980), ch. 6; L.E.W. Renfrey, *Arthur Nutter Thomas, Bishop of Adelaide, 1906-1940* (Adelaide, 1988), ch. 8.

⁵¹ *Church of England Messenger*, 28 June 1918 - 20 September 1918; T.B. McCall, *The Life and Letters of John Stephen Hart* (Sydney, 1963), pp. 47-50.

tabernacle and six tall candles (reputedly from a church in Naples), statues, relics, and outdoor processions. This was the 'naughty' face of 1920s Anglo-Catholicism.⁵²

Militant Anglo-Catholics often insisted that only by a 'more strenuous proclamation of the Catholic faith in its fulness' would the Church of England reach the urban working class.⁵³ Certainly Anglo-Catholic churches in inner urban areas attracted some working-class adherents, but, unlike their neighbouring Roman Catholic parishes, they never became part of Australian working class culture. However, Anglo-Catholicism did appeal to a significant body of middle and upper class Anglican churchgoers: the fusion of English nationalism with a sense of Catholic tradition was a potent mixture.⁵⁴ Some were attracted by the Anglo-Catholic view of 'the Church', which was at the same time both conservative and counter-cultural, for by seeking to restore what it saw as the ancient Catholic heritage of the Church of England it challenged the values and practices of contemporary Anglicanism. For this reason urban Anglo-Catholicism was attractive to individualists of many kinds: conservatives with a reverence for tradition and social hierarchy who disliked modern industrial society; young people who were escaping from a puritanical and ultra-Protestant upbringing; idealist rebels and intellectuals who were alienated from the bland respectability of conventional Anglicanism but who found a spiritual centre in the objective validity of the sacraments; people whose sense of the numinous was aroused by traditional Catholic worship and ceremonial. The journalist Keith Dunstan recalled from his years at All Saints' in Brisbane 'the whole sense of theatre'.⁵⁵ Others, drawing on a religious vocabulary, compared the experience to 'being in heaven'.⁵⁶ God seemed very near. Many of those who attended inner-urban Anglo-Catholic churches were single adults and a significant minority were homosexually-inclined men. In the 1940s when asked by a bishop whether 'certain types' attended Christ Church

⁵² John Handfield, *Friends and Brothers: A Life of Gerard Kennedy Tucker...* (Melbourne, 1980), ch. 11; obituary of Cyril Charles Barclay in *Australian Church Quarterly*, August 1967, pp. 8-13.

⁵³ E.g., Canon [P.W.C.] Wise, 'Obstacles to Religion in Australia arising from the Conditions of Australian Life in Towns', *Report of the Church Congress held at Melbourne, 19th to 24th November, 1906* (Melbourne 1907), pp. 40-50.

⁵⁴ E.g., Kerreen Reiger, 'Communal Aspects of an Urban Parish', in Donald E. Edgar (ed.), *Social Change: Readings in Sociology* (Melbourne, 1974), pp.182-8, a study of St Peter's, Eastern Hill, Melbourne.

⁵⁵ Keith Dunstan, *No Brains At All: An Autobiography* (Ringwood, Vic., 1990). p. 160. Dunstan was a parishioner of All Saints', Wickham Terrace, Brisbane, in the 1950s.

⁵⁶ Interview with Father K.M. Lindsay, Adelaide, 1 September 1992.

St Laurence, Father John Hope growled: ‘And is it not a good thing that these people so dear to our Lord have somewhere they can go?’⁵⁷ It was an unusually sympathetic view for the time.

In the late 1950s and early 1960s Anglo-Catholicism reached the peak of its influence within Australian Anglicanism. Religious orders of men and women gained a steady stream of recruits. Father Gabriel Hebert of the Society of the Sacred Mission, a theologian with an international reputation, taught at St Michael’s House in Adelaide. Bishop Ian Shevill of North Queensland, who was often in the news, set up the Anglican Truth Society to produce popular tracts and pamphlets. Since then, as in England and North America, the movement has declined in vigour and influence.⁵⁸ The reasons are complex. The social context has changed. Since the 1950s, as Australia’s links with Britain have weakened, the idea of an *English* national Catholicism has lost whatever appeal that it had to an earlier generation, and the new value placed on ‘community’ and spontaneity sits uneasily with the traditional Anglo-Catholic emphasis on hierarchy and formality in worship. Unlike Evangelicals, moreover, Anglo-Catholics had developed no significant youth organisations that could replenish their ranks. New research in history and theology has made it harder for Anglo-Catholics to be as definite as they once were about such things as the apostolic succession and the inherent Catholicism of the English Reformation. As a result of the modernising influences of the liturgical movement and the Second Vatican Council, and the adoption of *An Australian Prayer Book* after 1978, worship in avowedly Anglo-Catholic churches has become more like Anglican worship in general. The charismatic movement has had a deep influence in the Anglo-Catholic rural dioceses of Bunbury and North Queensland, whereas ‘extreme’ Anglo-Catholicism has flourished only among clergy in the diocese of Ballarat, under Bishop John Hazlewood (1975-93). In the capital cities since the 1960s many parish clergy and professional theologians who had been reared in the Anglo-Catholic tradition moved towards radical theology, while retaining the framework of sacramental religion. And in the early 1980s Anglican Catholic Renewal, which had been intended to forge a new identity, was fatally weakened by division among its members over the issue of women priests. However, the divisions among Anglo-Catholics are

⁵⁷ Rodd, *John Hope of Christ Church St Laurence*, pp. 235-6; also David Marr, *Patrick White: A Life* (Sydney, 1991), pp. 357-8. Cf. David Hilliard, ‘UnEnglish and Unmanly: Anglo-Catholicism and Homosexuality’, *Victorian Studies*, vol. 25, no. 2 (1982), pp. 181-210.

⁵⁸ For a well-informed critique, see Alan Wilkinson, ‘Requiem for Anglo-Catholicism?’ *Theology*, vol. 81 (1978), pp. 40-45.

no greater than among Evangelicals and Roman Catholics. Whatever form it takes in the future, there will continue to be a Catholic dimension to Anglicanism in Australia.